Contents

Preface xiii
Foreword xvi

PART I NURSING KNOWLEDGE AND THE CHALLENGE OF RELEVANCE

Introduction to Part I 2
Nursing knowledge 2
Two kinds of theory–practice gap 3
Philosophy of nursing science 4

1 Prehistory of the problem 6
The domain of nursing 6
Professionalization and the translation gap 8
Nursing education reform in the United States 9
Nursing research begins 11
A philosophy of nursing 13
What would a nursing science look like? 14
Nursing theory and nursing knowledge 16
Borrowed theory 16
Uniqueness 17
Conclusion: the relevance gap appears 18
vi  Contents

2  Opening the relevance gap  20
   Two conceptions of nursing science  20
   The demise of practice theory  22
      The argument from value freedom  22
      The argument from theory structure  23
   The consensus emerges  24
      Carper’s patterns of knowledge  24
      Donaldson and Crowley on the discipline  25
      Fawcett on the levels of theory  26
   The relevance gap  27
      The qualitative research movement  28
      The middle-range theory movement  29
   Conclusion: the relevance gap endures  30

3  Toward a philosophy of nursing science  32
   Philosophical questions about nursing  33
      Questions about the discipline  33
      Questions of philosophy  34
   Science, value, and the nursing standpoint  35
      Qualitative research and value-freedom  35
      Standpoint epistemology  36
   Theory, science, and nursing knowledge  37
      The received view of theory  37
      Explanatory coherence and inter-level models  38
      Consequences for nursing knowledge  39
   Conclusion: closing the gap  40

PART II  VALUES AND THE NURSING STANDPOINT

4  Practice values and the disciplinary knowledge base  44
   Dickoff and James’ practice theory  44
   Values and theory testing  45
   Challenges to Dickoff and James’ criteria  47
   Beckstrand’s critique  48
      Fact and value  48
      Intrinsic and instrumental values  49
Carper’s fact–value distinction 50
Problems with patterns 51
The disintegration of nursing knowledge 51
The obfuscation of evaluative commitments 52
The role of theory in ethical knowledge 53
Sociopolitical knowing 54
Conclusion: fact and value in nursing knowledge 55

5 Models of value-laden science 56
The Johnson model: nursing values as guides for theory 56
Constitutive and contextual values 58
Constitutive values in science: Kuhn’s argument 60
Epistemic and moral/political values 61
Models of value-laden inquiry 61
Value-laden concepts in nursing inquiry 62
Conclusion: constitutive moral and political values in nursing inquiry 64

6 Standpoint epistemology and nursing knowledge 65
Social role and epistemic privilege 65
Feminist appropriation of standpoint epistemology 66
Generalizing standpoints 68
Knowledge and the division of labor in health care 69
Nursing knowledge and nursing roles 71
Conclusion: nursing knowledge as an epistemic standpoint 73

7 The nursing standpoint 74
Top-down and bottom-up views of nursing 74
Values in the nursing standpoint 75
The philosophical questions revisited 76
Questions and concerns 77
What is the nursing role? 77
How are the boundaries of the profession determined? 78
Qualitative or quantitative? 79
Is nursing an applied science? 79
Conclusion: science and standpoint 80
PART III  NURSING THEORY AND THE PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

Introduction to Part III 82

8 Logical positivism and mid-century philosophy of science 84
  Some history and terminology 84
    Empiricism 84
    Logical positivism 85
  Conceptions of theory in nursing 86
  Theories and axiom systems 87
    Euclid and Newton 87
    Challenges to an axiomatic treatment of theory 88
    Implicit definition 89
  Theory structure: the received view 90
    Theoretical and experimental laws 91
    The hierarchy of theory 92
  Explanation and confirmation 93
    Explanation 93
    Theory testing 94
  Conclusion: logical positivism and scientific knowledge 95

9 Echoes in nursing 96
  Did logical positivism influence nursing? 96
    Three kinds of influence 97
      Positivism and the critique of nursing metatheory 98
  The metaparadigm of nursing 98
    Validity of the metaparadigm 99
    What is a “metaparadigm”? 100
  Levels of theory 100
    How the levels are distinguished 101
    How the levels are related 101
    Why the levels are supposed to be necessary 102
  Borrowed theory 103
  Conclusion: the relevance gap and the philosophy of science 104

10 Rejecting the received view 106
  Holistic confirmation 107
    The necessity of auxiliary hypotheses 107
    Auxiliary hypotheses and borrowed theory 108
    Consequences for nursing 109
Failure of the theory–observation distinction 110
   The vagueness of the distinction 110
   The role of training 111
   Observation and theory testing 112

Levels of theory and interdisciplinary research 112
   Theory change and level mixing 113
   Theoretical integration 114
   Consequences for nursing 115

Conclusion: rejecting the received view of nursing science 115

PART IV  THE IDEA OF A NURSING SCIENCE

Introduction to Part IV 118

11 Postnursing theory inquiry 121
   Passion for substance 121
   Situation-specific theories 122
   Postnursing theory inquiry 123
   Research example: mastectomy 124
      Background 124
      Patient responses to radical mastectomy 126
   Research example: pain management 127
      Background 127
      Sensory and distress components of pain 128
   Breakthrough research and situation-specific theory 129
   Conclusion: revisioning nursing theory 130

12 The structure of theory 131
   Walls and webs 131
   Questions and answers 133
      Coherence and confirmation 133
      Horizontal and vertical questions 134
   Breakthrough research revisited 135
      Radical mastectomy 135
      Pain research 136
   Borrowed theory 137
      Research example: pain intervention 137
      Borrowed theory and the nursing standpoint 138
   Conclusion: piecing the quilt 139
Contents

13 Models, mechanisms, and middle-range theory 141
What is middle-range theory? 141
An old, new definition of middle-range theory 142
The semantic conception and the received view 143
Middle-range theories as theoretical models 144
Physical and nonphysical theoretical models 145
The challenge of precision in nursing models 146
Interlevel models in nursing science 146
Theoretical models and explanatory coherence 148
Holism, reductionism, and the nursing standpoint 148
The holistic patient care argument 149
The inconsistency argument 150
The causation and control argument 151
Causality, holism, and professional values 152
Conclusion: causal models and nursing science 152

PART V CONCEPTS AND THEORIES

Introduction to Part V 156

14 Consequences of contextualism 158
Concepts: theory-formed or theory-forming? 158
Public and personal concepts 159
The priority of theory 161
Linguistic arguments for contextualism 162
Scientific and colloquial contexts 163
Contextualism and realism 165
Moderate realism 165
Contextualism and antirealism 166
Realism and representation 167
Concept analysis and borrowed theory 167
Conclusion: philosophical foundations of multifaceted concepts 169
Theory development and multifaceted concepts 170
Concepts, borrowed theory, and interlevel models 171

15 Conceptual models and the fate of grand theory 172
Models and theories 172
The orientation and abstraction pictures 173
Arguments against the abstraction picture
Harmful effects of the abstraction picture
Advantages of the orientation picture
Rereading the early theorists
Nursing pedagogy and early theory
Conceptualizing the nurses’ role
Models of nursing and models for nursing
Conceptual models as nursing philosophy
Philosophical criticism of conceptual models
Conclusion: science, practice, and philosophy

PART VI  PARADIGM, THEORY, AND METHOD

Introduction to Part VI
Terminological preliminaries

16  The rise of qualitative research
Making space for qualitative methodology: Carper, Benner, and Watson
The triangulation problem
  Triangulation and confirmation
  Objections to triangulation
Two paradigms of nursing inquiry
Conclusion: method, theory, and paradigm

17  What is a paradigm?
Components of a paradigm
  Theory and ontology
  Theory and method
  Values
Incommensurability
Pulling paradigms apart
  Theory and method (reprise)
  Theory and ontology (reprise)
Against paradigms
Conclusion: nursing science without paradigms
18 Methodological separatism and reconciliation  203

Reality and realities  204
   Idealism  204
   Meaning and reality  205
   Static and dynamic  206
Objective and subjective  206
Deduction and induction  208
Reductionism and value-freedom  208
The unity of nursing knowledge  209
Reconciling qualitative and quantitative research  209
   Methods as bridges  209
   The objective support  210
   The query support  210
   Method in the middle  211
Conclusion: local methodological decision-making  212

PART VII CONCLUSION

19 Redrawing the map  214

Theory  214
   Criteria for theory evaluation  215
   A new perspective on theory  216
   Evaluating theoretical models  217
   Evaluating intervention research  218
   Evaluating interpretations  218
   New questions about nursing theory  219
Professional values and disciplinary knowledge  220
Nursing knowledge and the relevance gap  221
   New questions about evidence-based nursing practice  222
New maps, new directions  224

References  225
Index  240