Index

A
Accessibility, of mentor, 196, 248
Active, role of mentors and students, 238–240, 263
American Academy of Arts and Sciences, 33, 63
Antimentor, 191, 239, 259
Apprenticeship: graduate training as, 156–157; vs. mentoring, 15
Attenuation of memes. See Extinction of memes
Authoritative parenting style, 197
Authorship, 111–112, 116, 188, 231, 236–237
Availability, of mentor, 195–197
Awards, system for granting, 227

B
Barton, M. (student), 54, 57
Baumrind, D., 197
Bohr, N., 5–7, 25, 159, 241, 242
Boyer, S. (pseudonym): collaboration, 83–84, 87, 150, 244–245; educating public, 89; guidance, 84; humanitarianism, 86; impact on students, 83–90; independence-guidance balance, 87–88; lab culture, 83–85; patient care, 88–89; relationship with Motulsky, 78–82; self-reliance, 84; social/ethical responsibility, 86–87, 89; voracious reading, 87, 90; work-family balance, 85

C
Collaboration, 107, 208–210, 247; Boyer and, 83–84, 87, 150, 244–245; Lewontin and, 107; Motulsky and, 75, 82
Continuity of memes, 230–237, 264; context of values, 235–237; learning to mentor, 234–235; in professions under pressure, 232–233
Conversation, as transmission pathway, 241–242
Creativity and innovation, 263–264
Creativity norms, 184–185
Crick, F., 10–11
Csikszentmihalyi, M., 9
Cultural capital, 74, 169
Cultural domain, xiv, 123, 124, 125t, 222, 223
Cultural evolution, 16, 222–223; apprenticeship as mechanism of, 127
Culture: change at cultural level, 263; pattern maintenance through mentoring, xi–xii; of students, 236. See also Memes
Cytogeneticist. See Gall, J.

D
Damon, W., 9
Dawkins, R., 16, 222–223
Dewey, J., 249–250
Diversity, adaptive value of, 212–213
DNA, discovery of, 11
Dobzhansky, T.: anticareerism of, 97; influence on Lewontin, 24, 93–98, 101, 104, 190; moralism of, 24, 96–97, 98
Domain category of memes, 123, 124, 125t
Dunn, L., 93

E
Einstein, A., 6, 95–96, 266
Emergence of memes, 148–151, 240
Erickson, E., 265
Ethical translation, 134
Evolutionary, systems perspective: cultural domain, xiv, 123, 124, 125t, 223; freedom-guidance balance and, 247–248; individual practitioner, 223; interaction among subsystems, 223–224; investing in mentees, 248–249; social field, 223. See also Memes
Experiential learning, 15, 156
Extinction of memes, 147–148, 149t, 232, 238

F
Fastow, A., 153
Field category of memes, 123, 124, 125t
Flow-supportive learning, 46
Funding, helping student secure, 169, 202–203, 204–205, 248
Future directions, for mentoring, 262–265

G
Gall, J., 33–62; academic career, 38, 231; admiration of, 48, 193; advisor during graduate school, 37; awards, 33, 42, 48; background, 24; breadth of interests, 50–51, 53–54, 228–229; at Carnegie Institute, 38; case study of student of, 54–61; creative accomplishments, 33–34; development of/formative influences on, 34–38; Gall’s students on Gall, 48–54; gender equality practiced by, 34, 42–43, 48, 52–54, 233; integrity, 50; lab culture, 45–46, 52–54, 57–58, 141–142, 158–159, 161, 170, 242, 244, 245; as mature scientist, 38–42; modeling by, 45, 51–52, 229; passion for research, 48–50; personal messiness of students, 51; as scientist’s scientist, 40; selection of students, 169; social/cultural capital provision, 74; training of next generation, 42–47; values, 46–47
Gardner, H., 9, 14, 171, 185, 191, 226
Generations concept, in present study, 8–9
Genetic research: competition in, 12–13; fraud in, 10
Genetics, 7–9
Global code sheet (GCS), 271–272; sample, 285–288
Good mentoring, 14; examples of, 29–32; how it works, 119–120; promoting, 219–220
Good Work (Gardner et al.), 10
Good work, defining, 9
Good-work memes, 132–142; creating facilitative lab structure, 140–142; fair and equal treatment of others, 135–137; giving students freedom and guidance, 137–140; honesty, integrity, and ethics in research, 132–135; number of members inheriting, 133t; number of members who inherited each meme, 133t
INDEX

GoodWork Project, 8, 9–10
Gould, S. J., 91, 98–99

H
Haidt, J., 244
Hammond, C. (pseudonym), 54–61; affinities with Gall, 56; influential qualities of, 58t; influential qualities of Gall, 58t
Henderson, K. (pseudonym): ethics, 114; feedback, 115–116; independence, 113, 115; merited authorship, 116; pathways of transmission, 115–116; relationship with Lewontin, 111–112; students on, 113–116; work ethic, 113, 114
Horizontal (peer) mentoring, 171–172
Hubby, J., 99
Human Genome Project, 11, 92
Hwang Woo Suk, 10

I
Implications for practice: future directions, 262–265; for mentees, 257–260; for mentors, 253–257
Inherited memes, 142–145; members possessing/inheriting each, 143t
Institutions, role in mentoring: preparation of mentors, 261–262; reward mentoring, 261; support, 260–261
Intel Science Talent Search, 13

J
Jenks, L. (student), 114–116
Journal article, rejection of student, 202

K
Keinänen, M., 171, 185
Kennedy, D., 1, 188
Key, T. (student), 54, 57
Kluckhohn, C., 122
Knowledge: tacit, 165–166, 241; transmission of (see Values/practice/knowledge transmission)

L
Last Supper Table, 100, 107, 109, 142, 161
Last Supper Table, 100, 107, 109, 142, 161; Marxist philosophy, 91–93, 100, 102, 108, 229, 237; as mature scientist, 98–99; meme transmission, 108–110; modeling, 110; publications, 91; resource provision by, 203–205; respect for diversity, 107; selection of students, 102, 168–169; sponsorship, 112; students on, 102–110; training the next generation, 100–102; value of mentoring, 103; work ethic, 113, 114

Lineage heads, choosing: Generation 1, 17–18, 20f; Generation 2, 18, 20f; Generation 3, 18–19, 20f. See also Gall, J.; Lewontin, R.; Motulsky, A.

Lineage-signature memes, 231; of Gall, 127–130, 146; of Lewontin, 131–132; of Motulsky, 130–131; number of lineage members inheriting each, 128t

Lysenko, T., 96

**M**

Memes: continuity of, 230–237, 264; defining, xx, 16; domain, xiv, 123, 124, 125t, 222, 223; emergence of, 148–151, 240; extinction of, 147–148, 149t, 232, 238; field, 123, 124, 125t; good-work (see Good-work memes); lineage-signature (see Lineage-signature memes); person category, 123, 124; possessed, 126; society/humanity, 123, 124, 125t–126t; survival through long apprenticeships, 243; survival through positive emotions, 244–245; transmitted by observation, 164–167. See also Memes, quantitative analysis of transmission

Memes, quantitative analysis of transmission, 121–153; coding process, 126; conclusion of analysis, 151–153; domain category of memes, 123, 124, 125t; extinction and emergence, 146–151; field category of memes, 123, 124, 125t; inherited/absorbed memes, 126; inherited memes, 142–145; intergenerational transmission of memes, 123–126; least inherited memes, 145–146; lineage-signature memes, 122, 127–132; memes all lineages share, 132–142; person category of memes, 123, 124; possessed memes, 126; practitioner-related memes, 125t; society/humanity category of memes, 123, 124, 125t–126t; types of memes, 125t–126t

Mentees: know yourself, 257; play active role, 259; seek good fit in learning/working environment, 258–259; seek good fit in mentor, 258; seek out multiple influences, 259–260

Mentoring: benefits of effective, 2, 3–4; by direct means, 240–242; by indirect means, 242–243; reasons for, 265–267; reflecting on, 26–27; vs. apprenticeship, 15; vs. sponsorship, 14–15

Mentoring chains, 122

Mentoring relationships, negative aspects of, 187–191; abuse and extreme self-interest, 188–189; authorship, 188; conclusions to, 216; intellectual property, 188; neglect, 189–191, 246. See also Mentoring relationships, positive aspects of

Mentoring relationships, positive aspects of, 192–216; admiration
for mentor, 192–193; availability and involvement, 194–198; conclusions to, 216–217; financial support, 202–203, 204–205; freedom-guidance balance, 198–202; frequent and positive feedback, 205–208; individualized interest in students and their work, 210–213; as personal, 213–216; resource provision, 203–204, 205; supportive atmosphere, 202; supportiveness, 193–194; treating students as collaborators, 208–210. See also Mentoring relationships, negative aspects of

Mentors, implications for practice, 253–257; address individual differences, 254–255; create community, 255–256; desirable characteristics of, 265; enact key values/practices in plain view, 255; facilitate building social capital, 256–257; help students learn by doing, 256; know yourself, 253–254; student selection, 254; think out loud, 255

Mentors: shortage of, 4. See also Mentoring; Mentors, implications for practice; Values/practice/knowledge transmission, mentor role in

Modeling: by Gall, 45, 51–52, 229; by Lewontin, 110; mentor role in, 162–164; by Motulsky, 75–77; as transmission pathway, 225–226, 241–242

Moral character, 225–226

Moral personality, 225

Morgan, T. H., 104

Motulsky, A., 63–90; admiration for, 192–193; anti-Semitism and, 64–65; awards, 63; background, 23–24; caring ethic, 79, 231; case study of student of, 78–82; collaboration, 75, 82, 83–84, 87; compassion, 244; conscientiousness, 79; development/formative influences on, 63–67; education of, 65–66; as founding father of medical genetics, 73, 74; guidance by, 71–72, 84; humanitarianism, 77–78, 79, 86, 229; independence-guidance balance, 87–88; intellectual freedom, 71–72; in Israel, 69; lab culture, 141, 158, 171, 245; as mature scientist, 67–70; modeling, 75–77; one-on-one meetings, 229; patient care, 88–89; public education, 68, 70, 80; on role of scientist, 68–71; selection of students, 82; self-reliance, 84; social/cultural capital provision, 74; social/ethical responsibility, 86–87, 89; student autonomy, 72–73; third generation (see Boyer, S.); training program of, 168, 242; voracious reading by, 87; at Walter Reed, 66; work-family balance, 80–81, 85

Muller, H., 97

Murray, H. A., 122

N

National Academy of Sciences, 33, 34, 49, 63, 262

National Institutes of Health, 11, 227

Naturalist. See Gall, J.

Neglect, of mentee, 189–191, 246

Nobel Prize in science, 11, 34, 43, 75, 97

O

Occupation, systems composing, 126

Oswaldt, P. (student), 113–114
P
Palmer, P., 63
Parenting: authoritative, 197; effective, 247–248
Parsons, T., xi
Patterns of culture, maintenance of, xi–xii
Person category of memes, 123, 124
Pharmacogenetics, 63
Physician scientist. See Motulsky, A.
Porter, B. (student), 54, 57, 59
Possessed memes, 126
Poulson, D., 37
Power abuse, by mentor, 2
Practice, transmitting. See Values/practice/knowledge transmission
Practitioner-related memes, 125
Present study: case approach, 30–31; coding procedures, 270–271; conceptual framework, 222–224; data analysis, 272–274; data collection, 19, 21, 269–270; gender issues, 19; global code sheet, 271–272; interview protocol, 275–283; lineage head choice, 17–19, 20f; privacy issues, 32; sampling strategy, 17–19, 20f; terminology issues, 22. See also Evolutionary, systems perspective
Professional pressures, 13–14, 226–228
Purposive sampling, 21

R
Racism, 98–99
Research topic, guidance in choosing, 45–46, 139, 200–201

S
Situated learning, 156
Skilling, J., 153
Smith, J. M., 99
Social capital, 169, 256–257
Social Darwinism, 99, 178
Society/humanity category of memes, 123, 124, 125t–126t
Sponsorship vs. mentoring, 14–15
Supportive relationships, 187–217, 246
Systems approach, 15–16.
See also Evolutionary, systems perspective

T
Tacit knowledge, 165–166, 241
Tacit learning, 164, 236, 259
Tenner, E., 153
Time management issues, 109–110, 251–253

V
Values/practice/knowledge transmission, 46–47, 155–186; coding process, 156; conclusions, 185–186; student role in, 182–185. See also Values/practice/knowledge transmission, laboratory role in; Values/practice/knowledge transmission, mentor role in
Values/practice/knowledge transmission, laboratory role in, 171–182; arming for survival, 179; competitive vs. cooperative lab, 177; cooperating now, and later, 180; “extra hands” concept, 176–177; independence-control balance, 177–178; labs as microcosms, 175–180; memes transmitted by lab structure, 181–182; nonlineage lab, 177; peers as teachers, 171–175; survival of the fittest now, and later, 178–179
Values/practice/knowledge transmission, mentor role in, 157–171;
creating learning environment, 167–171; by cultural/social capital provision, 74, 169–170; forms of talk, 159–162; good work, 166–167; group exchanges, 161; learning by observing, 163; memes transmitted by observation, 164–167; modeling, 162–164; one-on-one exchanges, 161; by physical space organization, 170; results of infrequency of exchanges, 162; by setting tone in lab, 170–171; by student selection, 168–169; tacit knowledge, 165–166; teaching by example, 163
Vertical mentoring, 171–172
Vygotsky, L., 22, 172

W
Watson, J., 11–13, 178
Wheeler, J., 7
Wilson, E. O., 35, 99

Z
Zone of proximal development, 172
Zuckerman, H., 43