Subject Index

*a priori* justification 38, 40, 44, 49–50, 52
and its consistency with Quine’s philosophy 38, 49–50
see also *analyticity*
abbreviated definitions 189–90
abstract objects 3, 106–7, 159, 281, 447
abstract objects in mathematics 2, 115, 124, 288–91
and holism 449
acquisition (of language) 168, 274, 314–15, 324, 328
and empathy 338
of truth functional connectives 230
see also *reference*
analytic/synthetic distinction 6, 11, 22, 39, 55, 120, 181–2, 192, 200, 284, 415, 442, 444, 475, 530–1, 559
and analysis 30–1
and indeterminacy of translation 250
and its lack of significance within science 22, 39
and Kant 21, 282
and the transcendence requirement 206–7
in Carnap’s work 55
in connection to math and logic 6–7
its importance to logical positivists 6, 21, 207
scope of Quine’s rejection of 211–12
analytical hypotheses 132, 166, 170, 238, 246–7
*analyticity* 40, 204
accounts of 203–4
and *a priori* knowledge 21–2, 282, 433, 436
and justification 41–2, 43
and language learning 7
Carnap’s conception of 7, 283, 474
Quine’s criticism of 474–5
epistemological variety of 41–2
for Bolzano 301
Frege’s conception of 283
metaphysical variety of 41
of arithmetic 282
pragmatic variety of 42
anomalous monism 80, 527, 545–6
argument from unrevisability 18
behaviorism 1, 74, 224, 263–4
and empiricism 264
and indeterminacy of translation 250–1, 266
and intersubjectivity 264
and meaning 103, 375, 530, 533
and Quine’s account of language acquisition 228–9
and Quine’s resistance to the generative program in linguistics 494, 502
and study of language 236, 484, 542
and syntactic theory 498
influences on Quine’s behaviorism 265
motivations for 265
ontological vs. evidential 264–5

Carnap’s influence on Quine 1, 70, 265, 281
Carnap’s logic of science 466–70
Chomsky’s internalist conception of language
485
and observational vs. descriptive adequacy
491–3
and social and rational aspects of interpretation 488
vs. Quine’s empiricism about language
489–91, 532
conceptualistic pragmatism 55, 57
confirmational holism 126, 130, 132, 190, 193
and the status of logical laws 193–6
contextual definition 404
in Quine vs. in Russell 404, 412
conventionality as undetermination 286
of physical laws 469–70
coordinating definitions 22
Quine’s criticism of 23

Duhem thesis see holism
Duhem-Quine thesis see holism

E-languages vs. I-languages 487–8
epistemology
division into conceptual and doctrinal aspects 352–3, 472, 476
normativity in 350–1
explication 98
and Carnap’s principle of tolerance 513
and its role in philosophy 510–11, 514
and paraphrase 523
and standards of exactness 513–14, 519
and theoretical unification 520
Carnap’s vs. Quine’s conception of 508–9, 521–3
examples of 98, 518–21
in Carnap vs. regimentation in Quine 517
in Carnap’s philosophy 509–11
in Quine’s philosophy 508, 521
vs. analysis 508
vs. paraphrasing away 522–3

extensionalism 3, 6, 70, 72, 76–7, 90, 93, 140, 517

global stimulus 339
global structuralism 83, 167
and inscrutability of reference 169

holism 7, 8–9, 39, 72, 122, 129, 205, 415–16, 528
and indeterminacy of meaning 538
and its consequences for Carnap’s epistemological program 352
and its consequences for the verification theory of meaning
and Quine’s extension of Duhem’s thesis 206, 209, 443
and the revisability of mathematics and logic 285, 314
holistic verificationism 115, 444–5, 449
and sense experience as observational touchstone 444–5
as resulting in paradox 445–6
see also indeterminacy of translation
holophrastic meaning 166, 173–4
hyper-Pythagoreanism 82–3, 115–16

indeterminacy
consequences of indeterminacy for meaning, reference, and propositional attitudes 459–60
in the form of permutations of sentences 243
of mental states 256
of word meaning vs. of sentence meaning 171–2
indeterminacy of meaning 169, 170
and inscrutability of reference 173–5
and radical translation 171, 174, 247–50
as a conjecture 173–5, 177
vs. indeterminacy of grammar 490
indeterminacy of reference 99
and Quine’s proxy-function argument 100
vs. indeterminacy of translation 102, 242, 252–3
indeterminacy of translation 10, 72, 99, 129, 237
and compositionality 257–8
and consequences for propositional attitude ascriptions 221–3
indeterminacy of translation (cont’d)
   and reification 275
   and semantic externalism 255
   and the argument from above 102–3
   and the argument from below 102–3
   and truth predicates 227–8
   and Universal Grammar 254–5
   apparent inconsistency of 237, 239, 242
   vs. underdetermination of translation 452, 455–6
indispensability argument 123–5, 290–1
   legacy of 294
inscrutability of reference 168
   and empiricism 166
   and its connection to indeterminacy of translation 166–7, 169–70, 456–8, 538
   argument from proxy functions 172–4
   varieties of 167
internal vs. external questions 55, 447–9, 472
language as a social phenomenon 265, 276, 316, 495, 505
   and Dummett’s full-bloodedness requirement 499
   and reconciliation of its private and public aspects 503–5
   and significance for linguistic theories 484–5, 488, 499, 500–1, 534
linguistic doctrine of logical truth 184, 283, 296
   remnant of in Quine’s philosophy 285–6
linguistic doctrine of necessary truth see linguistic doctrine of logical truth
linguistic theory of the a priori 434, 436–7
Quine’s attack on 434–7, 461
   see also linguistic doctrine of logical truth
logical analyticity (Bolzano) 304, 306–8
   quasi-logical analyticity 306
logical empiricism see logical positivism
logical positivism 21, 70, 191, 238, 281, 433, 527–9
   Carnap’s extension of 433–4
logical truth
   Carnap’s view of 296
   epistemic requirement on 296, 308
   formal definition of 296
   Quine’s view of 286, 288
maxim of minimal mutilation 62, 285
meaning
   as use 485, 499, 534
   truth conditional conception of 534, 536
   see also indeterminacy of meaning
modal terms 78–9, 97, 565
naturalism 2, 3–4, 114–15, 142, 148
   about meaning 135, 539
   and anti-foundationalism 150
   and empiricism 151
   and its consequences for the concept of experience 153
   and its consequences for the concept of meaning 152
   and its consequences for the concepts of belief and thought 152, 157–8
   and ontology 156, 159
Quine’s vs. other varieties of naturalism 150, 152, 531
   varieties of 116, 530
naturalized epistemology 4–5, 117, 142, 313
   and epistemological naturalism 114
   and its relation to Carnap’s logic of science 466
   and its relation to traditional epistemology 154–6, 324–3, 330, 465–6, 475, 479, 528
   and its tension with Davidson’s epistemological project 327–8
   and science 150
   and the parallel argument 356–7, 359
   and the scope of the scientific method 151
   as involving a change in subject matter 353–4
   conception of evidence within 364–6
   Davidson’s criticism of Quine on 354–5, 358, 366
   extent of Quine’s pursuit of 293–4, 505
   interpretive debates concerning the normative dimensions of 350
   Kim’s criticism of Quine on 352, 358, 366
   place of normativity in 5, 27, 46, 119, 122, 293, 358–9, 360–1
   relevance of psychology to 26, 351, 358, 360–1, 478
   role of observation in 314
nominalism
and Quine’s resistance to second-order logic 389
in Quine’s philosophy 288–90
motivations for 289
quasi-nominalism 292–3
Quine’s renunciation of 290

observation
and collateral information 317
and stimulus meaning 315
tension between private and public aspects of 333–4
theory-ladenness of 367–8
vs. observation sentences 334–5
observation categoricals 132, 363
observation sentences 73, 130, 132, 151, 160, 167, 335
and behavioral criteria of identity 322–3
and translation 318–19
as defined for communities 335–7
as defined for individuals 318, 335–7
as evidence 359
as vehicles of evidence 364
basic function of 321
fundamentality of 375
holophrastic construals of 167–8
holophrastic vs. piecemeal construals of 323, 367
Janus-faced conception of 320–1, 324, 330
linguistic and epistemological role of 323, 340, 375, 528
subject matter of 340–1
observationality
degrees of 316, 337, 368
occasion sentences 131, 246
ontological anti-naturalism 116, 123, 125
ontological commitment 81–2, 90
and empty names 91, 94–5, 388
and existence claims 82, 108, 288, 446
and genuine names 423–4
and its dependence on theory 96
and negative existentials 91, 94, 388, 420–1
and regimentation 89, 92, 446, 523
and universals 422–5
vs. ontology 90

ontological relativity 101, 115
and acquiescing in one’s home language 103, 226, 379, 505
and indeterminacy of translation 225–6
vs. inscrutability of reference 99
ontology
and realism 84–5
and reification 378, 393
and empty names 91, 94–5, 388
and existence claims 82, 108, 288, 446
and genuine names 423–4
and its dependence on theory 96
and negative existentials 91, 94, 388, 420–1
and regimentation 89, 92, 446, 523
and universals 422–5
vs. ontology 90

pragmatism
classical pragmatism 59–61
in Carnap’s work 56–7
in Quine’s philosophy 81, 529–30
Quine’s early exposure to 55
Quine’s influence on 56, 58, 65, 529
preestablished harmony 272, 321–2
and natural selection 322
principle of charity 539, 540–1
and its connection to Carnap’s and Quine’s different conceptions of truth 515
principle of tolerance 472, 510
and Quine’s rejection of 476, 515, 518
properties
Armstrong’s view of 76
Quine’s view of 76–7, 115
propositional attitudes 79–80
proxy functions 166, 168
publicity of meaning 103
publicity of meaning see language as a social phenomenon
quantification and logical particles 287
and ontology 374, 389, 423
and relative clauses 377
as a late stage in the emergence of reference 377
quantification and logical particles (cont’d)  

drawbacks of second-order 381–3  
responses to Quine’s rejection of  
second-order quantification 384  
plural quantification 390  
Quine’s restriction to first-order 380–3  
substitutional quantification 390–1  
see also quantified modal logic  
quantified modal logic  
and Aristotelian essentialism 73, 78, 386, 414  
and de dicto modality 79, 414, 418–19  
and de re modality 385–6, 405, 414, 418–19  
vs. de re belief ascriptions 420  
and modal paradox 408–12  
and notional modality 419–20  
and Quine’s rejection of verbal notion of  
necessity 386  
and Russell’s theory of descriptions 404, 409–11  
and the identification of necessity and  
analyticity 440–1, 461  
and three grades of modal involvement 408, 437–8  
present positions on 385–6, 414  
Quine’s criticism of 73, 79, 287, 384, 406–8, 413–14, 437–41  
Quine’s empiricism 3–4, 11, 17, 449, 528  
and the problem of accounting for  
mathematical and logical knowledge 281  
vs. Carnap’s 154  
Quine’s influence on contemporary  
metaphysics 108, 552–3  
Quine’s physicalism 2, 4, 13, 82, 128, 456  
radical interpretation 533  
and intensionality 542–3  
and truth conditional semantics  
see also radical translation  
radical translation 10, 74, 170, 220, 244, 454–5, 537, 538  
and behaviorist methodology 223, 225, 246  
and empathy 247, 338  
and language learning 496–7  
position of child vs. linguist 496  
and radical interpretation 538–9  
as a response to Carnap 236  
as an epistemological, not linguistic,  
exercise 319  
rational reconstruction 24–5  
in Quine vs. in Carnap 325–6  
reductionism 8, 24, 72, 127  
as a dogma of empiricism 414–15, 442–3  
in Quine’s philosophy 114–15, 128, 134, 141  
reference  
absolute vs. relative 458–9  
and ontology 378  
as a derivative notion 374, 393  
emergence of reference 229–31, 375–8, 393  
in connection with singular and general  
terms 376  
immanent vs. transcendent relations 226–7  
transcendent characterization of 379  
regimentation 156  
and generation of ontological commitment 95  
and grammatical analysis 97  
and holism 98–9  
and ideal language philosophy 532  
and indeterminacy 92  
and indifference to synonymy 92  
and names 392  
and ordinary paraphrase 516  
and propositional attitudes 158–9  
and quantification 389–91  
and Quine’s preference for first-order logic 93, 380–1  
and Russell’s theory of descriptions 94, 388  
and theory choice 106  
and variables 392  
as an idealization 157  
constraints on 95, 159–60  
goals of 89, 96, 105–6, 516–18  
procedures for 92–3, 96–7  
vs. semantic analysis 94  
rejection of first philosophy 25, 28, 116, 166, 351  
and its significance for the relationship of  
philosophy to science 28–32, 531  
Russell’s theory of descriptions 416–17, 421–2  
and attitude reports 417  
and Quine’s alternative 417–19  
and existence claims 421–2
scientism 116–18, 529
and the demarcation of science 118–23
standing sentence(s) 7
as approximating analyticity 8
vs. occasion sentences 244–5
stimulus
as evidence 344–6, 544
proximal vs. distal debate between Quine and Davidson 319, 327, 543, 545
proximal vs. distal stimulus for Quine 269–76, 537
stimulus analyticity 245–6, 453
stimulus meaning 129, 168, 170, 247, 316, 335, 452–3
affirmative vs negative 244
and collateral information 245, 339
stimulus synonymy 171, 245, 317
and preestablished harmony 326
subtle reductionism 205
see also reductionism
synonymy 40–1, 115, 128, 204
explanatory redundancy of 75, 135–6
theory/observation dichotomy 130, 132
third dogma of empiricism 543–4
third-person perspective on linguistic meaning see behaviorism (and meaning)
transcendence requirement 204, 208
and confirmation 209, 212
and indeterminacy of translation 227
and verificationism 209
transcendent vs. immanent notions 207, 209, 379
transience of definition 190
translation
and vagueness 339
as an immanent notion 211
as independent of general translation scheme 221
between artificial languages vs. natural languages 220–2, 225
constraints on translations 130, 243, 266, 317, 452–4
Quine vs. Davidson on 268–9
translation manuals 237–9
incompatibility of 237, 240–2
triangulation 269, 543
truth by convention 236, 435–7
Quine’s limited tolerance of 477
Quine’s rejection of 71, 284, 474
truth in virtue of meaning 196–200, 220, 310
vs. truth by convention 198
Two Dogmas of Empiricism 8, 21–2, 56, 181, 414
approaches to analyticity in 203
argument from confirmation holism in 190–1, 200–1
as articulating a pragmatic view of theory choice 64
circularity argument in 182–3, 186–7, 200–1, 442
its influence 11, 182, 192, 442
notions of meaning in 186
species of synonymy discussed in 182, 450
underdetermination of theory 9, 84–5
and pragmatic choice between theories 84
verificationism 130, 132, 191, 204, 443
web of belief 19–20, 45