

Contents

Preface	xi
1 Fundamentals of Probability and Judgement	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Probability and elicitation	1
1.2.1 Probability	1
1.2.2 Random variables and probability distributions	3
1.2.3 Summaries of distributions	5
1.2.4 Joint distributions	7
1.2.5 Bayes' Theorem	8
1.2.6 Elicitation	9
1.3 Uncertainty and the interpretation of probability	10
1.3.1 Aleatory and epistemic uncertainty	10
1.3.2 Frequency and personal probabilities	11
1.3.3 An extended example	12
1.3.4 Implications for elicitation	14
1.4 Elicitation and the psychology of judgement	14
1.4.1 Judgement – absolute or relative?	15
1.4.2 Beyond perception	18
1.4.3 Implications for elicitation	20
1.5 Of what use are such judgements?	20
1.5.1 Normative theories of probability	21
1.5.2 Coherence	21
1.5.3 Do elicited probabilities have the desired interpretation?	22
1.6 Conclusions	24
1.6.1 Elicitation practice	24
1.6.2 Research questions	24
2 The Elicitation Context	25
2.1 How and who?	25
2.1.1 Choice of format	25
2.1.2 What is an expert?	26

2.2	The elicitation process	27
2.2.1	Roles within the elicitation process	28
2.2.2	A model for the elicitation process	28
2.3	Conventions in Chapters 3 to 9	31
2.4	Conclusions	31
2.4.1	Elicitation practice	31
2.4.2	Research question	31
3	The Psychology of Judgement Under Uncertainty	33
3.1	Introduction	33
3.1.1	Why psychology?	33
3.1.2	Chapter overview	34
3.2	Understanding the task and the expert	35
3.2.1	Cognitive capabilities: the proper view of human information processing?	35
3.2.2	Constructive processes: the proper view of the process?	36
3.3	Understanding research on human judgement	37
3.3.1	Experts versus the rest: the proper focus of research?	37
3.3.2	Early research on subjective probability: ‘conservatism’ in Bayesian probability revision	38
3.4	The heuristics and biases research programme	38
3.4.1	Availability	39
3.4.2	Representativeness	41
3.4.3	Do frequency representations remove the biases attributed to availability and representativeness?	46
3.4.4	Anchoring-and-adjusting	47
3.4.5	Support theory	49
3.4.6	The affect heuristic	51
3.4.7	Critique of the heuristics and biases approach	52
3.5	Experts and expertise	52
3.5.1	The heuristics and biases approach	53
3.5.2	The cognitive science approach	53
3.5.3	‘The middle way’	54
3.6	Three meta-theories of judgement	55
3.6.1	The cognitive continuum	56
3.6.2	The inside versus the outside view	56
3.6.3	The naive intuitive statistician metaphor	58
3.7	Conclusions	58
3.7.1	Elicitation practice	58
3.7.2	Research questions	59
4	The Elicitation of Probabilities	61
4.1	Introduction	61
4.2	The calibration of subjective probabilities	62
4.2.1	Research methods in calibration research	67

4.2.2	Calibration research: general findings	68
4.2.3	Calibration research in applied settings	72
4.2.4	A case study in probability judgement: calibration research in medicine	74
4.3	The calibration of subjective probabilities: theories and explanations	77
4.3.1	Explanations of probability judgement in calibration tasks .	77
4.3.2	Theories of the calibration of subjective probabilities . . .	79
4.4	Representations and methods	82
4.4.1	Different modes for representing uncertainty	83
4.4.2	Different formats for eliciting responses	87
4.4.3	Key lessons	89
4.5	Debiasing	89
4.5.1	General principles for debiasing judgement	90
4.5.2	Managing noise	91
4.5.3	Redressing insufficient regressiveness in prediction	92
4.5.4	A caveat concerning post hoc corrections	94
4.6	Conclusions	95
4.6.1	Elicitation practice	95
4.6.2	Research questions	95
5	Eliciting Distributions – General	97
5.1	From probabilities to distributions	97
5.1.1	From a few to infinity	98
5.1.2	Summaries	99
5.1.3	Fitting	100
5.1.4	Overview	100
5.2	Eliciting univariate distributions	100
5.2.1	Summaries based on probabilities	100
5.2.2	Proportions	104
5.2.3	Other summaries	105
5.3	Eliciting multivariate distributions	107
5.3.1	Structuring	107
5.3.2	Eliciting association	108
5.3.3	Joint and conditional probabilities	111
5.3.4	Regression	112
5.3.5	Many variables	113
5.4	Uncertainty and imprecision	114
5.4.1	Quantifying elicitation error	114
5.4.2	Sensitivity analysis	115
5.4.3	Feedback and overfitting	116
5.5	Conclusions	118
5.5.1	Elicitation practice	118
5.5.2	Research questions	119

6	Eliciting and Fitting a Parametric Distribution	121
6.1	Introduction	121
6.2	Outline of this chapter	122
6.3	Eliciting opinion about a proportion	124
6.4	Eliciting opinion about a general scalar quantity	132
6.5	Eliciting opinion about a set of proportions	137
6.6	Eliciting opinion about the parameters of a multivariate normal distribution	139
6.7	Eliciting opinion about the parameters of a linear regression model	142
6.8	Eliciting opinion about the parameters of a generalised linear model	145
6.9	Elicitation methods for other problems	147
6.10	Deficiencies in existing research	149
6.11	Conclusions	150
	6.11.1 Elicitation practice	150
	6.11.2 Research questions	151
7	Eliciting Distributions – Uncertainty and Imprecision	153
7.1	Introduction	153
7.2	Imprecise probabilities	153
7.3	Incomplete information	156
7.4	Summary	160
7.5	Conclusions	160
	7.5.1 Elicitation practice	160
	7.5.2 Research questions	160
8	Evaluating Elicitation	161
8.1	Introduction	161
	8.1.1 Good elicitation	161
	8.1.2 Inaccurate knowledge	161
	8.1.3 Automatic calibration	162
	8.1.4 Lessons of the psychological literature	163
	8.1.5 Outline of this chapter	163
8.2	Scoring rules	163
	8.2.1 Scoring rules for discrete probability distributions	165
	8.2.2 Scoring rules for continuous probability distributions	169
8.3	Coherence, feedback and overfitting	171
	8.3.1 Coherence and calibration	171
	8.3.2 Feedback and overfitting	173
8.4	Conclusions	176
	8.4.1 Elicitation practice	176
	8.4.2 Research questions	177
9	Multiple Experts	179
9.1	Introduction	179

9.2	Mathematical aggregation	180
9.2.1	Bayesian methods	180
9.2.2	Opinion pooling	181
9.2.3	Cooke’s method	184
9.2.4	Performance of mathematical aggregation	185
9.3	Behavioural aggregation	186
9.3.1	Group elicitation	186
9.3.2	Other methods of behavioural aggregation	188
9.3.3	Performance of behavioural methods	190
9.4	Discussion	190
9.5	Elicitation practice	191
9.6	Research questions	191
 10 Published Examples of the Formal Elicitation of Expert Opinion		193
10.1	Some applications	193
10.2	An example of an elicitation interview – eliciting engine sales	193
10.3	Medicine	195
10.3.1	Diagnosis and treatment decisions	195
10.3.2	Clinical trials	199
10.3.3	Survival analysis	201
10.3.4	Clinical psychology	202
10.4	The nuclear industry	204
10.5	Veterinary science	206
10.6	Agriculture	207
10.7	Meteorology	208
10.8	Business studies, economics and finance	209
10.9	Other professions	212
10.10	Other examples of the elicitation of subjective probabilities	213
 11 Guidance on Best Practice		217
 12 Areas for Research		223
 Glossary		227
 Bibliography		267
 Author Index		307
 Index		313

